THE UNIVERSITY AND INDUSTRY COLLABORATION -ONLINE PLATFORMS TO SUPPORT COOPERATION IN BALTIC COUNTRIES AND FINLAND

LY HÕBE Estonian Entrepreneurship University of Applied Sciences Tallinn, Estonia <u>ly.hobe@eek.ee</u>

KATRIIN VISNAPUU Estonian Entrepreneurship University of Applied Sciences Tallinn, Estonia katriin.visnapuu@eek.ee

LJUDMILA PIHEL Estonian Entrepreneurship University of Applied Sciences Tallinn, Estonia Ijudmila.pihel@eek.ee

> LILIAN RÜCKENBERG Tallinn University Tallinn, Estonia <u>lilianr@tlu.ee</u>

Abstract: The success of any small country hinges on the education of its people, primarily provided by higher education institutions (HEI) or universities. While HEIs can excel independently, their success is amplified when they collaborate closely with industry. Such collaboration enables the provision of modern education meeting labor market demands and drives research and innovation. This symbiotic relationship benefits both parties: HEIs engage with cutting-edge technologies and issues, while industry gains access to skilled workers with practical training and specialized expertise. However, the key question for both parties is how to achieve mutually beneficial cooperation. Rather than seeking more engagement, the focus should be on fostering better, more relevant, and well-thought-out collaborations. One effective approach is the development of a common technical platform that integrates the needs and capabilities of all stakeholders.

A model of one such primary platform koolituskrediit.ee was developed by AS Mainor to allow employees from Ülemiste City (Estonia) companies to participate in training courses offered by various Estonian HEIs. As part of the Nordplus Horizontal project 'Platform for Co-operation Between Schools and Enterprises', representatives of nine partner organizations from Estonia, Finland, Latvia and Lithuania decided to further develop this platform to facilitate daily communication and services between universities and companies. The project's primary goal was to identify the key characteristics of an effective website or technical platform that is userfriendly for both service providers and the target audience. The aim was to develop a generic prototype platform that aggregates services from different schools and universities, fostering collaboration between academia and industry.

Accordingly, an analysis was conducted of existing web pages and platforms that aim to serve the interests of employees, enterprises, and individual learners (e.g. students, job seekers, other people). 29 platforms from Finland, Estonia, Latvia, Lithuania were analyzed, and some European or world-wide platforms were also included, which offer learning, research, internship, or job opportunities. The purpose of this article is to provide an overview of the collected knowledge and its application in the creation of the new Talent Portal (<u>Talendiportaal.ee</u>) platform.

Key words: university-industry collaboration, science & stakeholder engagement, education, consultancy of experts, internship, talent management, job opportunities, platforms

1 Introduction

The field of talent management has grown and advanced exponentially over the past several years, as organizations, large and small, public and private, global and domestic, have realized that to gain and sustain a global competitive advantage, they must effectively manage the process of finding, keeping and developing talents. Close cooperation with higher education institutions (HEIs) is one way to increase the company's competitiveness and to find and develop new talents.

Mutually beneficial collaboration is advantageous for both HEIs and employers. HEIs seek long-term and comprehensive cooperation built on transparent communication. Employers, on the other hand, view ideal collaboration as involving support from HEIs to ensure that students with appropriate competencies are connected with suitable employers.

This entails HEIs recommending interns to employers based on a match between students' strengths and the company's expectations. Such collaboration extends beyond internships to recruitment, with HEIs endorsing top-performing students to their business partners. This not only enhances students' skill sets but also adds value to their academic experience.

Ultimately, this collaborative approach facilitates the seamless integration of students into the workforce, benefiting both parties. Students secure suitable internships or employment opportunities, while companies gain access to talented individuals who meet their specific needs. This mutually beneficial arrangement creates a win-win situation, fostering positive outcomes for all involved.

These were only some possible examples of expectations for cooperation between HEIs and companies. In practice, the expectations for the collaboration between HEIs and industry are a complex endeavor influenced by various factors, including framework conditions, situational factors, people, and funding availability (Dan, 2013). While all parties recognize the significant value of collaboration, several barriers hinder joint cooperation, particularly in financing, resource availability and communication (Wilson, 2012; Dan, 2013; Davey, et al., 2018; Sieracka et al., 2022; Evans et al., 2023).

Inadequate communication between businesses and HEIs is cited as one of the main factors influencing potential cooperation (Awasthy et al., 2020; Sieracka et al., 2022). Communication involves the transfer of information among parties through various channels. To ensure efficiency, communication must exhibit transparency, credibility, and be presented in a comprehensible manner to all intended recipients, while also adhering to any confidentiality protocols and being economically viable. (Moenaert et al., 2000)

To ensure successful cooperation, it is crucial not only to address obstacles but also to actively promote the factors that drive collaboration between HEIs and companies. In its report, the European Commission (Davey, et al., 2018) proposes implementing new mechanisms to overcome challenges faced by HEIs and to foster stronger business relations. One suggested approach involves leveraging online and social media platforms such as ResearchGate, Academia.edu, LinkedIn, Twitter, and Yammer to increase the visibility of academics' profiles, making it easier for companies to identify potential research partners, facilitate collaborative research, and enhance knowledge exchange between academia and industry. (Davey, et al., 2018)

Furthermore, Awasthy et al. (2020) highlight the importance of addressing the visibility issue by advocating for the development of an online platform specifically designed to facilitate discussions and idea-sharing among academic professionals. This platform would serve as a catalyst for networking and collaboration within the academic community, addressing the underutilization of digital platforms and promoting knowledge sharing through targeted university strategies (Awasthy et al., 2020).

One way to approach the topic is through the ecosystem, where the network of interconnected organizations, focused on entrepreneurship, knowledge, and innovations, collaborate with the aim of generating collective value for end users. This value can be achieved through various means, including the creation and delivery of new products or services, as well as the advancement of novel knowledge. (Autio et al., 2014; Jacobides et al, 2018)

As a similar ecosystem, representatives of nine partner organizations from Estonia, Finland, Latvia and Lithuania decided to develop a platform that would simplify daily communication and services between HEIs and companies within the project 'Platform for Co-operation Between Schools and Enterprises'. The core goal of the project was to study more closely the cooperation between HEIs and companies, and then the expectations for a website or a technical platform that would be easy to use for both the service provider and the target group. This article gives a more detailed overview of the results of the conducted research, which were also an input to the creation of the prototype of the joint collaboration platform between higher education institutions and companies Talent Portal (Talendiportaal.ee).

2 The essence of collaboration between higher education institutions and industry

In the current competitive landscape, the collaboration between HEIs and industry plays a pivotal role in fostering innovation and developing talent. There is a growing focus on assessing the state of the economy, education, the lifelong learning ecosystem, and devising effective strategies to support these services within society. This section delves into the fundamental principles and practices that underpin successful collaboration between academia and the business sector, emphasizing its significant impact on both domains.

The transition from industrial to post-industrial information societies has underscored the growing emphasis on collaboration between HEIs and industry (Freeman, 1982). The significance of this collaboration for innovation and education is widely acknowledged (Rybnicek et al., 2019).

Nowadays, policymakers worldwide emphasize the importance of establishing strong connections between businesses and HEIs. They stress the importance of a strong relationship between business and higher education as a means of generating economic activity, allocating significant funds to encourage such cooperation (Brem et al., 2017; Orazbayeva et al., 2019). Furthermore, the symbiotic relationship between HEIs and companies not only promotes the overall growth, competitiveness, and sustainability of both entities (Evans et al., 2023; Pacheco et al., 2023), but also contributes to regional development (Pacheco et al., 2023). Due to the above, different countries create and follow unique cooperation strategies in this regard (Sieracka et al., 2022).

Presently, HEI and business collaboration encompasses various forms of direct and indirect engagements between HEIs and businesses, with the aim of mutual benefit (Melicherikova, 2012). This collaboration spans a wide array of activities, ranging from pioneering research in cutting-edge technologies to skills development for existing employees, and from establishing university science parks to guiding entrepreneurial students through the complexities of the business landscape. Additionally, it includes supporting the creation of spin-out companies and aiding government agencies in attracting substantial investments from major employers. Moreover, it involves enhancing business acumen among undergraduates and assisting small companies in recognizing the benefits of hiring recent graduates. (Trencher et al., 2013)

Academics and practitioners collaborate on research projects, pooling their expertise and resources to address pressing issues, contribute to the development of products and services (Pavlin et al., 2009; Evans et al., 2023) and advanced knowledge in their respective fields (Pavlin et al, 2009; Galán-Muros et al., 2016; Evans et al, 2023). Additionally, this collaboration integrates labor market competence into teaching through course development, curricula design, and inviting industry specialists to contribute to educational seminars and lectures (Chryssou, 2020; Evans et al., 2023). Aforementioned efforts may include workforce development through initiatives such as career days, apprenticeships, and case studies for student engagement (Pavlin et al., 2009; Kailer et al., 2011; Schiuma et al., 2018; Evans et al., 2023). These examples of diverse forms of collaboration underscore the multifaceted nature of the relationship between HEIs and companies, highlighting the mutual benefits derived from such partnerships.

Companies benefit from collaboration with HEIs by fostering internal innovation (Evans et al., 2023; Pacheco et al., 2023) and providing learning opportunities for their employees (Galán-Muros et al., 2016; Manyika et al., 2017). Employee development emerges as crucial for sustainable organizational growth (Karim et al., 2019). In addition, companies contribute to curriculum development to tailor educational programs and student knowledge according to their own company needs, thereby increasing the suitability of graduates to meet the company's requirements and enabling companies to recruit top talent that meets their needs, thus enhancing their competitiveness (Arranz et al., 2022).

For HEIs, this HEI-industry cooperation represents a balanced approach to applied and fundamental research, offering tangible solutions to real-world challenges and enhancing research impact. Collaboration enriches faculty learning experiences, elevates teaching standards, yields financial gains, and enhances institutional reputation. (Evans et al., 2023) Practices such as presenting workplace case studies, conducting surveys, establishing apprenticeship agreements, and documenting learning processes bolster universities' effectiveness in fostering soft skills. Such a collaboration fosters tighter integration with the workplace, encouraging students to apply professional experiences in academic settings and infuse real-world examples into their studies. (Boll et al., 2017)

As authors conclude their exploration of the essence of cooperation between HEIs and industry, it becomes evident that fostering successful collaboration requires a nuanced understanding of various elements. Following discussion brings out the important factors that support successful partnerships between HEIs and industry, with the aim of gaining a more detailed view of the mechanisms that drive effective collaboration and its wider implications.

Common goals, commitment, context, trust and communication emerge as key factors in fostering successful and sustainable joint cooperation (Wilson, 2012; Rakovska et al., 2014; Davey, et al., 2018; Awasthy et al., 2020; Sieracka et al., 2022; Evans et al., 2023). Active and effective communication and dialogue between HEIs and companies plays vital roles for successful collaboration (Dan, 2013; Galán-Muros et al., 2016; Davey, et al., 2018; Sieracka et al., 2022), although the implementation often falls short due to the formalized and ineffective policies (Rakovska et al., 2014). While poor communication hinders collaboration, proficient communication nurtures it, driving progress and synergy between the involved parties (Rakovska et al., 2014; Galán-Muros et al., 2016; Awasthy et al., 2020; Sieracka et al., 2022). Effective communication serves as the linchpin, facilitating nimble cooperation by fostering mutual understanding and ensuring efficient coordination of activities. Moreover, organizational culture differences and finding suitable contacts pose additional challenges to successful cooperation (Mora-Valentin et al., 2009; Bruneel et al., 2010; Galán-Muros et al., 2016). Insufficient information rises a significant barrier to effective collaboration among stakeholders.

Accordingly, enhancing collaboration between a company and a university relies on employing effective communication strategies. To achieve this, the company must identify its requirements, while the HEI should offer a range of services it can provide or assess the

company's needs beforehand and tailor an offer based on targeted research within the relevant domain (Sieracka et al., 2022). Creating a common information system is essential to facilitate smooth cooperation (Prendi et al., 2021).

European Commission (Davey, et al., 2018) proposes to use new modern work tools such as technical collaboration platforms or artificial intelligence to improve communication between HEIs and companies. The authors of the article are of the same opinion - the integration of new technologies into cooperation is essential to maintain competitiveness in today's business landscape. In addition, effective communication, which was especially important during the pandemic as a crisis, emphasizes the importance of implementing digital communication platforms. These collaboration platforms can act as global network brokers, facilitating the exchange of information and enabling rapid responses tailored to business needs.

Drawing from the theoretical framework presented earlier, it is evident that effective communication between HEIs and industry is paramount. However, it is also apparent that current communication channels are inadequate, posing a significant challenge to collaboration and even scare parties away from potentially useful collaboration (Titov et al, 2024). In light of this, the authors advocate for the development of a unified platform to streamline interaction.

This proposed platform, envisioned as an ecosystem, seeks to bring together various stakeholders, including academia, industry representatives, and students. As the potential of such an innovative online platform to foster collaboration and generate new opportunities in HEI and industry partnerships is explored, questions arise regarding the criteria such a technical platform should meet and whether existing solutions should be utilized or a new collaboration platform should be developed. Answers to these inquiries will be provided in the subsequent subsection.

3 Research methodology

Based on the recommendation of the European Commission (Davey, et al., 2018), to implement new mechanisms to promote cooperation between HEIs and companies, including online and social media platforms, the authors decided to conduct a study. Although the cooperation between HEIs and companies is constantly expanding, there is currently a lack of relevant studies that would cover the sector as a whole. Therefore, the following research questions were set for the study:

- What cooperation platforms already exist in the countries participating in the project 'Platform for Co-operation Between Schools and Enterprises' project and at least in Europe, in addition to the international platforms outlined by the European Commission report (2018)?
- Which are the advantages and disadvantages of existing platforms?
- Which are the functions or services provided in the best collaboration platforms?

In order to find an answer to the first research question - which cooperation platforms already exist and how cooperation between HEIs and companies takes place - online platforms offering study, research, practice and work opportunities of the countries participating in the project were defined as the research object. The authors evaluated 29 platforms from Finland, Estonia, Latvia, Lithuania, but also included few European or world-wide platforms, which offer learning, research, internship, or job mediation opportunities. One of the reasons for this sample was that the representatives of the countries participating in the project are best aware of the use of these platforms and the convenience that comes with it. The survey was conducted and the most well-known platforms in aforementioned regions were identified and some internationally known platforms were involved. The final sample consisted of 29 platforms (Fig. 1)

Estonia (5)	Latvia (4)	Lithuania (3)	Finland (7)	International (10)
 Adapter Koolitus.edu.ee (Juhan) Koolituskrediit OSKA Stardilava.ee 	 Jobs in Latvia Platform for Educational courses Platform for internships (RISEBA) SS Portal 	 Countline Live University Training Club 	 Jobiili Jobs in Finland Jobs Market Jobs Portal Tuudo XAMK Duuni Your Agent 	 Coursera EdX Enlight Euroguidance Europass European Job Days LinkedIn MyInternship.eu ORCID UDEMy

Figure 1 The sample used in the study Source: authors own study

The primary criteria for the selection of platforms were their well-knownness, popularity and usability in the given region, the assessment of which was based on the project participant's own broad horizons and long-term experience in the field of education, as well as feedback from partner companies, colleagues and students.

Having selected both regional and international platforms, project participants started working on the second research question - which are the advantages and disadvantages of those particular platforms? As many of the web pages and platforms are created for one of these offerings (learning, research, internship, or job opportunities) only, those sections/offerings were analyzed separately. Structure of the research:

- Overview of offerings and target groups: learning (target group: employees), research (enterprises), internship (students), job opportunities (students, other people).
- Best examples of the web pages per each offerings (providing the link and describing what is good).
- Good examples from all other web pages (analysis of web pages) per each offering (target group)
- Examples of what should be done differently in these platforms to succeed per each offering (target group).

A research team comprising experts from various fields including education, economics, technology and social sciences was formed to conduct the study. To ensure a diverse and balanced view, three members of the research team participated in the evaluation of each platform.

The platforms were evaluated based on three points of view:

- Compliance with the cooperation expectations of the HEIs and companies, e.g. target groups (HEIs, companies, students, private persons etc) and list of services which are provided to all users.
- User-friendliness, e.g. ease of navigation, functionality, search options and links to other platforms etc.
- Technical manageability and design, e.g. management responsibility and cost of using the platform etc.

Detailed evaluation criteria were established for each category, including the purpose of the platform, business model, target groups, list of services provided, user-friendliness, calls to action, structure/navigability, functionality, hyperlinks, search options, accuracy of information, connections/links with other interfaces/platforms, advantages/disadvantages, and success factors (as detailed in Appendix 1).

As per the theoretical part of the article, HEIs aspire for cooperation with companies to be broad, enduring, and transparent. Conversely, companies primarily seek to recruit new talent and enhance research capabilities. Consequently, the cooperation between HEIs and enterprises is a multifaceted subject, prompting the expectation that the evaluated platforms could encompass a wide array of services. These services include facilitating educational exchanges, extending research opportunities to companies, mediating student research topics and assignments, providing expert/guest lecturers for HEIs, and facilitating internship and job placements. The evaluation process included a thorough analysis of the platforms according to the defined evaluation criteria, where each expert first evaluated the platform separately, and then the final evaluation was decided by consensus. The obtained results were jointly analyzed, comparing different platforms and finding out their strengths and weaknesses.

The answers to all research questions provided a good overview of the existing platforms, highlighting their attributes and deficiencies. These insights will serve as valuable input for the development of a new collaboration platform. A detailed overview is provided in the subsequent chapter.

4 Results and discussions

The analysis (in 2023) conducted on various cooperation platforms between HEIs and companies reveals a dynamic landscape characterized by the proliferation of online platforms catering to actors within the education and labor market ecosystem. These platforms, while diverse in their offerings, often exhibit a propensity to target specific segments or provide narrow services, reflecting both the specialization and fragmentation inherent in contemporary collaboration frameworks.

Within this context, while the examined platforms demonstrate notable advantages, including a well-articulated value proposition tailored to their respective target audiences, they also manifest limitations that underscore the exigency for enhanced functionality and improved connectivity with other interfaces/platforms. These limitations present barriers to effectively addressing the multifaceted needs and interests of stakeholders, thus impeding the realization of seamless cooperation between HEIs and companies.

In examining platforms providing learning opportunities, such as Linkedin, Koolitus.edu.ee, Coursera, Udemy, and others, it became evident that employers are increasingly seeking to train their staff according to their own needs. Despite advantages like easy navigation, a wide range of industry-tailored courses, and professional certificates, several disadvantages were identified, including the absence of English versions and outdated information. To address these issues, proposals were made to offer training opportunities in all specialties and to design tailored education to meet the needs of both employees and employers.

Platforms, such as Adapter, offering research opportunities were found to be limited, with only a few providing this service. Enterprises expressed an expectation for access to professional knowledge and research from universities, indicating a desire for collaboration. Despite the advantages of platforms enabling direct contact and assistance, proposals were made to establish sections for finding partners for applied research and to enhance direct communication channels for information exchange.

While several web pages offer continuing education and training opportunities, there is a lack of high-quality platforms dedicated to providing practical learning experiences and job opportunities for students. To bridge this gap, proposals were made to offer internship opportunities in all specialties and to empower students to actively search for intern positions within their fields.

A salient observation emerging from the analysis is the dearth of dedicated spaces for networking and collaborative endeavors, signifying a broader deficiency in fostering synergistic

relationships and interactions within the ecosystem and its broader socio-economic context across the surveyed countries. This deficit underscores the imperative for concerted efforts aimed at fostering greater visibility and coherence in the relational dynamics among ecosystem actors to catalyze meaningful collaboration and innovation.

Upon delving deeper into the research results with the overarching goal of fostering robust and comprehensive cooperation between HEIs and companies, several pivotal components emerge as foundational pillars for an effective cooperation platform:

Compliance with cooperation expectations:

- Integration of all services, products, and segments within a singular platform to provide a holistic solution that caters to the diverse and evolving expectations of stakeholders, ranging from internship opportunities to facilitating cutting-edge research collaborations.
- Clarity in articulating the platform's value proposition to all stakeholders, including HEIs, companies, students, and private individuals, thereby facilitating informed engagement and fostering a sense of alignment with their respective goals and aspirations.
- Incorporation of testimonials and success stories from relevant stakeholders to instill confidence and motivation among new users, offering tangible insights into the platform's efficacy in meeting their expectations.

User-friendliness:

- Transparent communication of the platform's overarching purpose and functionality from the homepage, serving as a guiding beacon for users seeking to navigate the platform seamlessly and achieve their desired outcomes efficiently.
- Implementation of intuitive and user-friendly navigation features, particularly critical for platforms catering to a diverse array of segments with varying levels of digital literacy and technological acumen.

Technical manageability and design:

- Ensuring linguistic parity by maintaining consistency between local language and English content, recognizing the burgeoning trend towards internationalization within the academic and corporate spheres.
- Development of a robust technical infrastructure characterized by agility and scalability, allowing for swift adaptations to external changes or evolving user preferences while minimizing operational overheads.
- Facilitation of streamlined communication channels with platform administrators through innovative features such as chatbots or comprehensive notification systems, ensuring responsive and personalized support for users across diverse contexts and scenarios.

Aspect	Description
Integration of all services	All services, products, and segments are integrated into a singular platform, providing a comprehensive solution for stakeholders with diverse expectations, ranging from internships to research collaborations.
Clarity in articulating value proposition	The platform clearly communicates its value proposition to all stakeholders, including HEIs, companies, students, and private individuals, aligning their goals and aspirations and fostering informed engagement.

Incorporation of testimonials and success stories	Testimonials and success stories from relevant stakeholders are incorporated to instill confidence and motivation among new users, providing tangible insights into the platform's effectiveness in meeting expectations.
User-friendliness	Transparent communication of the platform's purpose and functionality from the homepage facilitates seamless navigation, enabling users to efficiently achieve their desired outcomes. Intuitive navigation features cater to users with varying levels of digital literacy and technological acumen.
Technical manageability and design	Linguistic parity is ensured by maintaining consistency between local language and English content, acknowledging the trend towards internationalization. A robust technical infrastructure allows for agility and scalability, minimizing operational overheads and facilitating swift adaptations to external changes or evolving user preferences.
Facilitation of streamlined communication channels	Streamlined communication channels with platform administrators are facilitated through innovative features such as chatbots or comprehensive notification systems, ensuring responsive and personalized support for users across diverse contexts and scenarios.

These findings collectively underscore the imperatives for a comprehensive, adaptable, and user-centric cooperation platform that serves as a catalyst for fostering synergy and collaboration between HEIs and companies. Such a platform, underpinned by a robust technological framework and a keen understanding of stakeholder needs, holds the potential to transcend existing limitations and catalyze transformative innovation and knowledge exchange within the education and labor market ecosystem.

5 Conclusions

The essence of collaboration between HEIs and companies lies at the heart of fostering innovation, knowledge exchange, and regional development. In today's dynamic landscape, characterized by the transition from industrial to post-industrial information societies, policymakers emphasize the pivotal role of strong connections between businesses and HEIs in driving economic activity and fostering sustainable growth.

However, an in-depth analysis of various cooperation platforms within the education and labor market ecosystem reveals a fragmented landscape, where existing platforms often cater to specific segments or offer narrow services. While these platforms exhibit strengths in articulating their value propositions and functionality, they also display limitations, particularly in terms of connectivity with other relevant platforms and the absence of dedicated spaces for networking and collaboration.

These findings underscore the imperative for a comprehensive and user-centric cooperation platform that transcends existing limitations and fosters meaningful collaboration between HEIs and industry stakeholders. The development of such a platform requires a nuanced understanding of stakeholder expectations and needs, coupled with robust technical infrastructure and seamless integration with other relevant platforms.

Drawing upon the insights gleaned from the research, it becomes evident that ecosystem thinking offers a viable framework for creating an effective learning environment characterized by constant interaction, real-life practice, and the involvement of local communities. By addressing the shortcomings identified in existing cooperation platforms and ensuring alignment with stakeholder expectations, the envisioned cooperation platform prototype holds

the potential to facilitate productive collaboration, driving innovation and knowledge exchange while fostering regional development.

In conclusion, the research findings serve as a valuable input for the creation of a new cooperation platform that anticipates and addresses the identified shortcomings, thereby ensuring effective collaboration that meets the expectations and needs of all stakeholders involved. This platform, grounded in ecosystem thinking and informed by a thorough understanding of stakeholder dynamics, has the capacity to catalyze transformative innovation and drive sustainable growth within the education and labor market ecosystem.

References

Arranz, N., Arroyabe, M.F., Sena, V., Arranz, C.F.A., and Fernandez de Arroyabe, J.C., 2022. University-enterprise cooperation for the employability of higher education graduates: a social capital approach. *Studies in Higher Education*, 47(5), pp. 990-999. https://doi.org/10.1080/03075079.2022.2055323.

Autio, E., and Thomas, L., 2014. Innovation Ecosystems: Implications for Innovation Management? In M. Dodgson, D. M. Gann, & N. Phillips (Eds.). *The Oxford Handbook of Innovation Management, pp. 204-228*, Oxford University Press.

Awasthy, R., Flint, S., Sankarnarayana, R., and Jones, R.L., 2020. A framework to improve university–industry collaboration. *Journal of Industry-University Collaboration*, 2(1), pp. 49-62. <u>https://doi.org/10.1108/JIUC-09-2019-0016</u>.

Bolli, T. and Renold, U., 2017. Comparative advantages of school and workplace environment in skill acquisition: Empirical evidence from a survey among professional tertiary education and training students in Switzerland. *Evidence-based HRM*, 5(1), pp. 6–29. https://doi.org/10.1108/EBHRM-05-2015-0020.

Brem, A., and Radziwon, A., 2017. Efficient Triple Helix collaboration fostering local niche innovation projects – A case from Denmark. *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, 123, pp. 130-141. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techfore.2017.01.002</u>.

Bruneel, J. D'Este, P. and Salter, A., 2010. Investigating the factors that diminish the barriers to university– industry collaboration, *Research Policy*, 39(7), pp. 858–868.

Chryssou, C.E., 2020. University–industry interactions in the Sultanate of Oman: Challenges and opportunities, *Industry and Higher Education*, 34(5), pp. 287-367.

Dan, M.-C., 2013. Why Should University and Business Cooperate? A Discussion of Advantages and Disadvantages. *International Journal of Economic Practices and Theories*, 3(1), pp 67-74. Available at: web address: <<u>https://www.researchgate.net/publication/324091355 Why Should University and Busine</u> <u>ss_Cooperate_A_Discussion_of_Advantages_and_Disadvantages</u>> [12 march 2024].

Evans, N., Miklosik, A., and Du, J.T., 2023. University-industry collaboration as a driver of digital transformation: Types, benefits and enablers. *Heliyon*, 9(10). https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2023.e21017.

Davey, T., Meerman, A., Galan Muros, V., Orazbayeva, B., and Baaken, T., 2018. *The state of university-business cooperation in Europe*. Final report. European Commission, 2018 [online] Available at: <<u>https://publications.europa.eu/resource/cellar/1b03ee59-67a4-11e8-ab9c-01aa75ed71a1.0001.01/DOC_1</u>> [14 january 2024].

Freeman, C., 1982. The Economics of Industrial Innovation. Harmondsworth: Penguin.

Galán-Muros, V. and Plewa, V., 2016. What drives and inhibits university-business cooperation in Europe? A comprehensive assessment, *R&D Management*, 46(2), pp. 369–382. https://doi.org/10.1111/radm.12180.

Jacobides, M.G. Cennamo, C., and Gawer, A., 2018. Towards a Theory of Ecosystems. Strategic Management Journal, 39(8). <u>10.1002/smj.2904</u>.

Kailer, N. and Thum-Kraft, M., 2011. Competence development in start-ups and SMEs: What is the role of higher education institutions as cooperation partners?, *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Venturing*, 3(3), pp. 248-261. <u>10.1504/IJEV.2011.041274</u>.

Karim, M., Choudhury, M.M., and Latif, W.B., 2019. The impact of Training and Development on Employees' Performance: an analysis of quantitative data, *Noble International Journal of Business and Management Research*, 03(02), pp. 25-33. [online] Available at: <<u>https://www.researchgate.net/publication/331147751_THE_IMPACT_OF_TRAINING_AND_DEVELOPMENT_ON_EMPLOYEES'_PERFORMANCE_AN_ANALYSIS_OF_QUANTITATI_VE_DATA</u>> [03 january 2024].

Manyika, J., Lund, S., Chui, M., Bughin, J., Woetzel, J., Batra, P., Ko, R., and Sanghvi, S., 2017. *Jobs Lost, Jobs Gained: What the Future of Work Will Mean for Jobs, Skills, and Wages, McKinsey Global Institute, Report, 2017.* [online] Available at: <<u>https://www.mckinsey.com/featured-insights/future-of-work/jobs-lost-jobs-gained-what-the-future-of-work-will-mean-for-jobs-skills-and-wages</u>> [03 february 2024].

Melicherikova, Z., 2012. University- Business Cooperation Current Situation in Slovakia and Europe. *European Research Studies*, XV(4), pp. 89-105. <u>10.13140/2.1.5122.3680</u>.

Moenaert, R.K., Caeldries, F., Lievens, A. and Wauters, E., 2000. Communication flows in international product innovation teams. *Journal of Product Innovation Management*, 17(5), pp. 360–377.

Mora-Valentin, E.V. and Ortiz-de-Urbina-Criado, M., 2009. Improving the effectiveness of academicbusiness models: an analysis of obstacles in R&D activities in service industries. *Service Business*, 3(4), 395-413. <u>10.1007/s11628-009-0075-5</u>.

Orazbayeva, B., Davey, T., Plewa, C., and Galan-Muros, V., 2019. The Future of University-Business Cooperation: Research and Practice Priorities. *Journal of Engineering and Technology Management*, 54, pp. 67-80. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jengtecman.2019.10.001</u>.

Pacheco, A. and Franco, M., 2023. The Role of Higher Education Institutions (HEI) in Academic Spin- off Creation: A Cooperation Perspective, *Journal of the Knowledge Economy*. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s13132-023-01390-x</u>.

Pavlin, S., Akkuyunlu, A., Kovačič, H. & Svetlik, I., 2009. Report on the Qualitative Analysis of Higher Education Institutions and Employers in Five Countries: Development of Competencies in the World of Work and Education. Hegesco Project. Ljubljana: University of Ljubljana.

Prendi, L., Kraja, G., and Nexhipi, O., 2021. University-Business Cooperation: The Case of Albania. International Journal of Economics, Commerce and Management, Vol. IX, No. 11, pp. 132-143.

Rakovska, N., Pavlin, S., and Melink, M., 2014. Assessment of cooperation between higher education institutions and employers in Europe. [online] Available at: <<u>https://www.eurashe.eu/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/emcosu-assessment-of-cooperation-between-higher-education-institutions-and-employers-in-europe-wp4-report..pdf</u>> [23 january 2024].

Rybnicek, R., and Königsgruber, R., 2019. What makes industry–university collaboration succeed? A systematic review of the literature. *Journal of Business Economics*, 89(2), pp. 221–250. <u>10.1007/s11573-018-0916-6</u>

Schiuma, G. and Carlucci, D., 2018. Managing Strategic Partnerships with Universities in Innovation Ecosystems: A Research Agenda, *Journal of Open Innovation: Technology, Market, and Complexity*, 4(3). https://doi.org/10.3390/joitmc4030025.

Sieracka, S. and Wirkus, M., 2022. Communication as a Factor Limiting University-Business Cooperation. *GATR-Global J. Bus. Soc. Sci. Review*, 10(1), 38–46. https://doi.org/10.35609/gjbssr.2022.10.1(5).

Titov. E., Kantanen, M., Pihel, L., Kvelde, A., 2024. PERCEPTION AND BEHAVIOUR OF BALTIC AND FINNISH COMPANIES CONCERNING THE EMPLOYEES' TRAINING IN HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS. INTED2024 Proceedings. 6910-6917. https://doi.org/10.21125/inted.2024

Trencher G., Yarime M., McCormick K.-B., Doll, C., and Kraines, S.B., 2013. Beyond the third mission: Exploring the emerging university function of co-creation for sustainability, *Science and Public Policy*, 41(2014), 151–179. <u>https://doi.org/10.1093/scipol/sct044</u>.

Wilson, T., 2012: A Review of Business–University Collaboration. Higher Education Funding Council for England & University of Hertfordshire. [online] Available at: <<u>https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/32383/12-610-wilson-review-business-university-collaboration.pdf</u>> [18 march 2024].

Appendix 1 Platform observation criteria

- **Title of the Platform:** identifying the name of the platform being observed.
- **Purpose of the Platform:** describing the primary reason for the platform's development or its business goal.
- Business Model:
 - clarifying whether services are paid or free;
 - determining who is financing the platform;
 - assessing the clarity of the pricing page in communicating the value of the product and different plans.
- **Target Group(s):** identifying the specific audience or user demographic the platform is designed for.
- List of Services Provided: outlining the various services offered to users or different target groups and explaining their unique solutions.
- **Ease of Use:** evaluating the user-friendliness of the platform, considering different target groups' perspectives.
- Calls to Action (CTAs): assessing the clarity and accessibility of CTAs on the platform.
- **Structure/Navigability:** analyzing the ease or difficulty of navigating the platform, including menu navigation, homepage icons, and site structure.
- **Functionality:** evaluating the discoverability and usability of the platform's functions and ensuring that links and buttons are working properly.
- **Hyperlinks:** examining whether the homepage effectively directs users to relevant information through hyperlinks.
- Search Options: assessing the availability and effectiveness of search features on the platform.
- Accuracy of Information: verifying the correctness and reliability of the information provided on the platform.
- **Connections/Links with Other Interfaces/Platforms:** identifying any connections or links the platform has with other interfaces or platforms.
- Advantages/Disadvantages: listing the strengths and weaknesses of the platform based on observations.
- Success Factors: determining the key factors contributing to the platform's success.
- **Suggestions for Improvement:** providing recommendations on what could be done differently for the platforms to succeed or improve further.